

I. EXECUTIVE SESSION

A regular meeting of the Board of Trustees of the Charleston County School District was held on Tuesday, September 10, 2012 in the Board Room at 75 Calhoun Street with the following members of the Board present: Mrs. Cindy Bohn Coats - Vice Chair, Mr. Craig Ascue, Rev. Chris Collins, Mrs. Elizabeth Kandrac, Mrs. Elizabeth Moffly, Mr. Brian Thomas, and Dr. Nancy J. McGinley, Superintendent and Executive Secretary. Mr. Chris Fraser – Chair and Mrs. Ann Oplinger were absent. Staff members Mr. Michael Bobby, Dr. Lisa Herring, Mrs. Audrey Lane, Mr. Bill Lewis, Mrs. Melissa Metarazzo, Dr. Brenda Nelson, and Mr. John Emerson were also in attendance.

The news media was duly notified of the meeting and representatives were present.

Mrs. Coats called the Open Session meeting of September 10, 2012 to order at 4:00 p.m. Rev. Collins moved, seconded by Mr. Thomas, to go into Executive Session to discuss agenda items listed below. The motion was approved unanimously.

1.1: Student Transfer Appeals - In County Requests

1.2: Kiawah River Plantation TIF Proposal – Mr. Michael Bobby – Chief Financial & Operations Officer – This item was pulled from the agenda.

OPEN SESSION

II. CALL TO ORDER, INVOCATION/MOMENT OF SILENCE, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The Board reconvened in Open Session at 5:15pm. Mrs. Coats called the meeting to order. Then she called for a Moment of Silence followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.

III. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Mr. Ascue moved, seconded by Rev. Collins, approval of the September 10, 2012 amended agenda. The motion was approved 5-1 (Kandrac opposed).

Mrs. Kandrac moved, seconded by Mrs. Moffly removal of agenda **11.2 - Board Travel Requests from Outgoing Board Members to Attend Conferences in October** since it was not supported by four board members as required by policy. The policy states that only "out of state travel is agenda vote-able", in state travel does not require board approval.

After Mr. Ascue said he would support Mrs. Kandrac's request to go to the conference. Mrs. Kandrac said she would probably be the only board member to attend the Risky Business conference. Mrs. Coats asked if the item should be pulled from the agenda to allow Mrs. Kandrac the opportunity to have a discussion with the board chair at a later time. Mrs. Kandrac said she expected to be registered for the conference immediately because she was elected to represent her constituents until November 12th. Rev. Collins called for a board vote. Mrs. Kandrac asked who was trying to block her from performing her duties as a board member.

IV. SPECIAL RECOGNITIONS

There were no Special Recognitions to come before the board at this meeting.

V. SUPERINTENDENT'S REPORT

- Dr. McGinley called for a Moment of Silence in memory of Mrs. Minnie Alston, former District 1 Constituent Board Member, who passed during the weekend. Her husband is Rev, William Alston.
- **Child Development and Head Start** returned last Tuesday. Over 2500 students and their

families were welcomed into the CCSD family. The role the CD and Head Start programs play is to prepare kids for kindergarten

- **Seventh-day Enrollment** is the highest it has been since 1999. This represents a 1523 student increase from last year. The district's enrollment now 46,000. Dr. McGinley shared her opinion about the increase in enrollment attributing it mainly to families choosing CCSD over other options.
- Trident United Way (TUW) Campaign kicked off this Friday. Dedicated volunteers from local businesses were at schools painting classrooms and hallways, building shelves and tutoring. Bosh employees were out in full force at Lambs Elementary. Fifty members from Joint-based Charleston spent the day at Jane Edwards Elementary improving the grounds and Benefit Focus staff members were at Liberty Hill Academy. Dr. McGinley thanked companies and others across the county who routinely volunteer in CCSD schools. Last year CCSD raised \$116,000 for TUW. The district's goal this year is to raise \$125,000. An investment in TUW is an investment in students and families.
- **Charleston Achieving Excellence Update** – the update tonight will focus of Neighborhood Planning Team result for Murray LaSaine Elementary. Mrs. Ruth Taylor, Assistant Associate Superintendent of the Elementary School Learning Community will present information from the Neighborhood Planning Team results.
 - Rev. Collins requested pre-k level Head Start student enrollment. Ms. Terri Shannon said approximately 2,000. He also requested enrollment information on the number of students below kindergarten level. Mr. Bobby said that information was included in a recent Friday Update that was sent to the board. Mrs. Kandrak asked Mr. Bobby to provide information on head start again since many questions are answered in the Friday Updates are not shared with constituents. Mrs. Kandrak asked what year Child Development (CD) was included in district's enrollment and if birth to three included in the district's 46,000 enrollment number. Ms. Terri Shannon said last year (2011) for Head Start began and CD began much earlier.
 - Mr. Ascue requested staff look at the number of students the district loses and why. He also commented on Dr. McGinley's mention of Mrs. Minnie Alston. Mrs. Alston was a tired-less educator that worked in Title I schools in the district. She spoke often about how students that had to ride a bus downtown to be educated and advocated for equality for all students.
 - Mrs. Kandrak requested the Police report and spoke about a policy amendment for district drivers' needing a chauffer's license.
 - Mrs. Moffly asked if number included charter students. Mrs. Coats said it was. Dr. McGinley said there were 3,300 charter students.

VI. VISITORS, PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS

1. Mr. Thomas Colleton from District 1 Constituent Board thanked Dr. McGinley for remembering Mrs. Alston. Mr. Colleton said Mrs. Alston often joked about having to load up a bus to bring community members to Calhoun Street to get something done. Then he spoke about the news article about low enrollment at Lincoln HS and questioned if it was necessary to bring a bus load of community members to Calhoun Street to address District 1 issues.

VII. APPROVAL OF MINUTES/EXECUTIVE SESSION AGENDA ITEMS

7.1: Open Session Minutes of August 27, 2012

Mrs. Kandrak moved, seconded by Mrs. Coats, approval of the Open Session Minutes of August 27, 2012 with revisions provided earlier by Mrs. Kandrak. The motion was approved with a vote of 6-0.

7.2: Motions of Executive Session of September 10, 2012

The board voted on Motions of Executive Session of September 10, 2012 as follows:

1.1: Student Transfer Appeals - In County Requests

Rev. Collins moved, seconded by Mr. Ascue, to approve the following student transfer appeal recommendations. The motion was approved 6-0.

- 1.1A – Approve
- 1.1B – Approve

Mr. Ascue requested capacity information be added to Student Transfer spreadsheet.

Rev. Collins requested a monthly capacity report.

1.2: Kiawah River Plantation TIF Proposal – Mr. Michael Bobby – Chief Financial & Operations Officer - Pulled

Since this item was pulled from the Board agenda. No action was taken.

7.3: A. Financial Minutes of August 27, 2012

Mrs. Kandrak moved, seconded by Mr. Ascue, approval of the Financial Minutes of August 27, 2012. The motion was approved with a vote of 6-0.

Mrs. Kandrak asked about the final amount for the Workers' Compensation item. Ms. Enck said case has not been settled at this time.

VIII. CAE UPDATE

8.1: Murray LaSaine ES – Neighborhood Planning Team Results – Mrs. Ruth Taylor – Assistant Associate Superintendent ES Learning Community

Mrs. Taylor presented information on the Murray LaSaine ES NPT Results as follows.

- ***Why school choice?***
 - *Student Achievement and educational equity*
 - *Increase parent support and involvement in schools*
 - *Decrease racial isolation*
 - *Provide alternative types of learning environments that may better match children's needs.*
 - *Encourage the creativity of educators.*
 - *Spur schools to match the needs of today's families through expanded services and extended hours.*
- ***Current Enrollment at Murray LaSaine Elementary***
 - *Continued decrease in the last five years*
 - *Current enrollment is 195*
- ***Neighborhood Planning Team participants***
 - *Principal, Teachers, Parents, PTA, Community, Constituent School Board, Institute of Higher Learning and District Support*
- *A sample survey was sent by the Murray LaSaine ES principal to James Island Parents. Based on the survey the Neighborhood Planning Team concluded that most students would probably not leave Stiles Point or Harborview to attend Murray LaSaine for a strong Math Program, which was high on the list of programs recommended, because those schools already have strong math programs. Upon receipt of the survey, there was a discussion about a Montessori School which was also discussed in earlier years. After visits were made to Montessori and academic focused schools, the NPT voted unanimously voted to support the Montessori Program. Mrs. Taylor shared data on the number of students waiting to get into a Montessori program was shared.*

- Rev. Collins asked if the proposal was to make the entire school Montessori. Mrs. Taylor confirmed and stated that the current enrollment is very low at Murray LaSaine ES. Rev. Collins how many parents had students that currently attend Murray LaSaine. Mrs. Taylor said even though several opportunities were extended parental attendance was not good. Rev. Collins said while he supports the Montessori program, he wants parental involvement even if it meant scheduling a cookout and extending invitations to parents. He prefers having both--a traditional program and a Montessori Program. Mrs. Taylor shared other options on James Island to include available seats at James Island Elementary. Rev. Collins inquired about the various groups that support the Montessori program reiterating that he wanted the involvement of MLES parents. Dr. McGinley responded to Mr. Collins regarding the composition of the NPT and said the list of participants is the same list followed since she wrote a paper outlining composition of the of NPT. Also, she said many opportunities were extended to parents. When there appeared to be a controversy with the Montessori program at James Simons, Dr. Nelson and parent educators knocked on doors to get input from James Simons ES parents. Murray LaSaine has been under enrolled for many years. In order to renovate the school, decisions must be made on the program that would be housed there and funds are available in the current building plan for renovations for M. LaSaine ES. If parents choose not to have their children in a Montessori, they may choose to send their kids to James Island Elementary where there is space. If it is the wish of the board, the program could be phased out similar to what's being done at James Simons ES. Dr. McGinley also shared the zone chart and said if a Montessori program is placed at that school, there would be a Montessori program in each of the four zones.
- Rev. Collins asked if the proposal is to make the entire school a Montessori school. Mrs. Taylor said this is the first part of the project and final decisions are not available at this time. Rev. Collins asked about the capacity of Murray LaSaine. Mrs. Coats said 375. Also, Rev. Collins asked the racial makeup of students. Mrs. Taylor said more than 90% African Americans with a very low percentage of others. Mrs. Taylor said the previous principal Mr. Bright extended many opportunities to reach parents to visit Montessori program. Rev. Collins suggested a picnic type event be scheduled for parental involvement purposes to educate parents about the Montessori program
- Mrs. Kandrak inquired about the current principal is at Murray LaSaine ES asking if he was certified as an Elementary School principal. Mrs. Taylor said Mr. James Reinhardt, the interim principal was certified to be an elementary school principal. Mrs. Kandrak requested an updated copy of the 2016 zone chart and surveys from Lincoln HS rezoning meeting. She asked again the number of surveys received from parents. Mrs. Taylor shared the following. The NPT discussed the results of the surveys received. Mrs. Kandrak asked how many surveys were submitted. Mrs. Taylor replied, Murray LaSaine ES -121, Harborview ES- 303, Stiles Point ES – 396, James Island ES – 59 and Head Start – 8.
- Mr. Thomas inquired about the number of parents that supported a strong math and science program but would probably not be willing to leave their school and said a strong math and science program would probably turn the school around.

- Mr. Ascue inquired about a program to serve mentally challenged students at M. LaSaine. Mrs. Taylor the program would serve all students. Mr. Ascue suggested some sort of outreach to include going to homes, churches and other means. He concluded that enrollment would increase if more effort was made to attract more students.
- In response to Mrs. Kandrak question about grade levels that would be served, Mrs. Taylor said early childhood through 5th grade.
- Rev. Collins asked about grandfathering in current students there. Mrs. Taylor said they would. It would have partial magnet status.
- Dr. McGinley said 125 out of 195 responses is very high for Murray LaSaine. The school reached out to parents and offered to take them to see the Montessori program. Mrs. Ruth Taylor said she would bring exact numbers from sign in sheets. Mrs. Taylor said parents could write option in if what they wanted was not listed.
- Mr. Thomas asked if other options were listed by parents. Mrs. Taylor said they provided options but there wasn't enough support to move forward.
- Mrs. Kandrak asked for rankings of options offered for M. LaSaine ES. Mrs. Taylor said Math and Science was number one for the community but Montessori was number one for the Neighborhood Planning Team.
- Mrs. Kandrak requested surveys be left with secretary for her to look at. Mrs. Taylor said she would leave them with Mrs. Stoney. Mrs. Kandrak asked about the low number of surveys from James Island ES. Mrs. Taylor said it was probably not sent out on time.
- Mrs. Coats asked about the next steps. Mrs. Taylor said the NPT work is done.

IX. MANAGEMENT REPORT(S)

X. COMMITTEE REPORT(S)

10.1: Audit & Finance Committee – Mrs. Cindy Bohn Coats - Mrs. Coats said A&F on Thursday Sept 16th at 3pm.

10.2: Policy Committee – Mrs. Elizabeth Moffly

A. Second Reading – Policy DKC - Expense Authorization, Reimbursement

Mrs. Moffly moved, seconded by Mr. Ascue, approval of the Second Reading of Policy DKC – Expense Authorization Reimbursement. The motion was approved 6-0.

Mrs. Moffly said the only change is “board member and”.

B. Second Reading – Policy GBEBDA - Cell Phone Acceptable Use

The Board discussed on the Second Reading of Policy GBEBDA – Cell Phone Acceptable Use recommendation. The first reading was approved on 7/23/12.

Mrs. Moffly said several things were changed. Rev. Collins and Mrs. Moffly said there were allowances for hands free phone.

Mr. Emerson said the draft included in the agenda has alternate paragraphs and he wasn't sure how they got there. The second bulleted paragraph was intended to delete the first bulleted paragraph and the first one should be deleted. Rev. Collins said the second part was inaccurate. Mrs. Coats suggested it be pulled until the next meeting Sept. 18th at 9:15am.

Mrs. Coats requested it be added to the September 24th agenda for second reading after it is corrected since two members from the policy committee (Collins and Moffly) were unsure of what it should be. Mr. Emerson tried to clarify revisions and said some language should be deleted. He also said sometimes there are so many revisions it is impossible to display all of them.

Mrs. Kandrac said paralegal has done a great job for years. Normally policy has lines striking through old language. Mr. Emerson said it is not marked because sometimes if a policy has been re-written so much, it would not be legible if all revisions were shown.

Mrs. Moffly agreed to take this policy back to the Policy Committee.

XI. POTENTIAL CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

11.1: Procurement Audit for FY 2011-2012 Mr. Michael Bobby – Chief Financial & Operations Officer

Mr. Thomas moved, seconded by Mr. Ascue, approval of the recommendation to accept the Procurement Audit for FY 2011-12 as presented. The motion was approved 5-1 (Kandrac).

Mr. Bobby said as instructed at a previous meeting, the Procurement Audit is brought back to the board. The letter of "agreed upon" items has been addressed. The result of the procurement audit is strong compared to audits prepared five years ago because the district has improved its processes. Also, the timeline was improved and it was prepared closed to the end of the fiscal year and the district chose to have it done annually instead of the required every three years. Mrs. Moffly asked about the directive of the budget and control board. Mr. Bobby said it's included in email in the board's the packet and the district followed those directions. Due to proper protocol the Policy Committee has addressed, the board has approval audit authority for all district audits. The RFP from 2007-2008 was actually for 8 years. That still doesn't get the district out of the four year period to utilize the company the district is now using, as required by the state. So it was really a 2008-2010 RFP with the additional option but it does not get the district from approval for the three years that's being used at this time. She said since it was done in 2007, the procurement code changed requiring board approval of the district's procurement auditing services.

Mr. Bobby said the contract under current conditions was approved by the board in 2006 or 2007. Therefore authorization from RFP expired in 2011. Therefore, she would like honesty since talking about unauthorized procurement. She wants the recommendation amended to ask the superintendent to address the 1240.2 corrective actions which requires more than what is stated in document provided. She requested written language addressing the issue with corrective action taken to correct the issue and action taken against the individual staff member. Mr. Bobby asked Mrs. Coats for permission to ask Mr. Larry Finney to address the board.

Mr. Finney asked if this was about the annual financial audit or procurement audit. Mrs. Moffly said procurement audit. She asked if the RFP was issued for and opinion and when it went from opinion to agreed upon audit. Mr. Finney said there were discussion with Materials and Management Office (MMO) and when they do their work, the procedures are provided. The procedures come from the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants (CPA) said

when they do not have a judgment in the professional procedures or they the directions are provided by someone else, they are called an agreed upon procedure. However, he thinks since then, they have gone back to the regulations which call for an audit. That's why the letter was issued that agree upon procedures are no longer acceptable and it would be replaced by an audit.

Mrs. Moffly said she read the information from the Budget and Control board and it mentioned contacting someone for an opinion for the annual procurement audit. Mr. Finney said that is why it's been changed from opinion. She said the last audit the district received was also an agreed upon procedure. Mrs. Moffly said she just wanted to understand when the RFP changed to agree upon audits. Mr. Finney said it was just based on discussions with MMO and was statewide with CPA firms because it's what the regulations called for. Moffly said this is. Separate from the state's RFP because this is the district's RFP. Mr. Finney said it still didn't change the findings that were discussed in the Finance & Audit Committee meeting. So it has gone back to an audit opinion now.

Mrs. Moffly asked Mr. Bobby when the board voted on the change and said it had nothing to do with the auditing firm because they are doing an excellent job. However, it has to do with the district's policy and if part of that procedure is board approval, she doesn't recall staff receiving board approval.

Mrs. Coats asked Mrs. Moffly where she found that information. Mrs. Moffly said policy that says board approval is required is in the CCSD Procurement code 1240.1 - Unauthorized ratification of the Procurement Code. Her issue is board approval was not obtained for Greene, Finney, and Horton prior to the Procurement Audit being done. However, Mr. Bobby said staff followed the policy already in place. Going forward, the board will follow the new policy. Mrs. Moffly said the RFP expired in four years. Mrs. Coats said everyone else seems to think it expires in 2012 including the State Budget and Control Board. Mrs. Moffly said the procurement code changed February 2011. Mr. Ascue asked if the board changed that particular line item. Mrs. Moffly said she said earlier "as the governing board of this district the Board shouldn't have to ask an employee for permission regarding an audit". Then she concluded that regardless to what was said in the letter received, it was an unauthorized audit. Mrs. Coats said moving forward it would be brought to the board for approval. Mr. Bobby said the board approved the contract which specified the number of years it could be extended. Mr. Feil will verify same. They now have directives that will be followed going forward. Mrs. Coats said the minutes said the motion of February 3rd failed 6-3.

Mr. Ascue said he understood Mrs. Moffly's concern. The RFP should have come to the board. Mr. Ascue asked Moffly if she had a problem working with the firm. Moffly said she didn't. Mrs. Moffly her concern is that the district issued something that did not have board approval. She said the district enforces policies and hold staff accountable if policies are not followed. Therefore, there be some type of corrective action to correct this mistake and that it incident is documented by the superintendent. Mrs. Coats asked Mrs. Moffly if she wanted to bring this item back to the board at a future meeting for board discussion. Mrs. Moffly requested written corrective action be a part of motion that the policy be followed in its entirety. Mr. Thomas would not accept a friendly motion since he didn't have details and suggested another motion

could be made. The district has followed the five year that includes the two years that could be extended by the Superintendent and three by board action which comes to a total of ten years. If the board wishes to do something different, it could be done going forward.

Mrs. Moffly said when the policy changed she said the board should not have to ask for permission from a CCSD employee to get an audit. Her problem is not with the work but the procedure not being followed. Mr. Bobby said the board approved the contract with specifics on how many years it could be extended. The extension came to the board two years ago. Mrs. Coats said the minutes show that the motion failed 6-3. Mrs. Moffly said she would forward the RFP to staff. Although the state's Budget and Control Board gave the district a pass, she is concerned that the district did not follow the procedures. Normally when there is a regulation or policy change it affects the way things are done. The RFP expired in 2011. That is four years. Mrs. Coats said the state accepted that per an email received and everyone else believes the expiration date is 2012. Mrs. Moffly she said part one is there has already been an unauthorized ratification. Part two should be corrective action.

Mrs. Coats asked Mr. Bobby to respond to Mrs. Moffly's question about Greene, Finney & Horton being hired prior to an RFP. Mr. Bobby said if that's what the policy says, staff is looking at the fact that they were already in place prior the policy that was written that way. They followed the policy in place at the time the contract for services. However, when the contract for services goes out again, the procedure will already be in place.

Rev. Collins said Mrs. Moffly wanted the superintendent to comply with the code and reprimand individual that violated the policy in writing to avoid future occurrences. Mrs. Moffly said violation could be found on code 11.1-25.

Rev. Collins inquired about the 20% for Small Women and Minority Business Enterprise (SWMBE) goal and said only 11% was being done with women and minority. A year earlier staff said they'd exceed the goals. Mr. Feil said previous year there was more major construction that allowed more minority businesses to participate. Since there is less business, the number is lower. Rev. Collins asked staff to address the issue. Mr. Ascue the number would improve if the district considered all purchased services; not just construction. Rev. Collins said CCSD should find some SWMBE businesses with to get numbers up. Then he said even if the board approved this agenda item tonight, compliance could still be addressed.

11.2: Board Travel Requests from Outgoing Board Members to Attend Conferences in October – Mrs. Moffly moved, seconded by Rev. Collins approval of board travel requests from outgoing board members to attend conferences in October 2012. The motion was approved 6-0.

Mrs. Coats led the discussion regarding Board Travel Request from Outgoing Board Members to Attend Conferences in October. She said two members are not running for re-election. The question is should they travel to conferences that close to the last scheduled meeting. Mrs. Coats asked who the two members were. Mrs. Coats said Mrs. Oplinger and Mrs. Kandrac.

Rev. Collins suggested the board not waste time discussing similar items. Mr. Thomas said he expected board members to be respectful of taxpayers' money during board travel to

conferences. Mr. Ascue agreed and said it's up to the board member.

11.3: School Bus Schedules & School Start Times (Collins, Coats, Ascue and Moffly)

As requested by the four members listed above, the board will discuss School Bus Schedules and School Start Times.

Rev. Collins led the discussion regarding School Bus Schedules & School Start Times.

Mrs. Moffly requested a board workshop on School Start times, bus schedules and small schools. Mrs. Coats requested the district schedule a workshop as soon as possible. Mr. Ascue board needs to look at school schedule, student transfers and small schools and how it relates to board goals to close the achievement gap.

Rev. Collins asked about information received in the Friday Update. Mr. Bobby said information was provided on two and three tier bus stop and said bell times and after school information was provided. Mr. Norman is looking at school start and stop time to see if there is a variation.

Rev. Collins said he saw the amount to change from a two tier to three tier system. Rev. Collins asked if the district owned buses or Durham. Mr. Bobby said Durham has buses and there are state owned buses. Rev. Collins asked for clarification on amounts. Mr. Bobby said they had to consider state and Durham buses because not sure if state or Durham would have to provide buses and there is a cost for driver and gas.

Dr. McGinley said the issue is bigger than dollars and cents because this issue would require public engagement. She will bring information to the board in October. Mr. Thomas said it would be necessary to consider traffic and rush hour issues. Mrs. Kandrak suggested the information be brought to the board on October 23rd meeting. She also inquired about state and Durham buses. Mr. Bobby said state ran its own bus service. Mrs. Moffly ended the discussion after stating that student achievement is linked to sleep deprivation.

XII. NEW BUSINESS

1. Mrs. Kandrak asked for the police report on employee accident. She also asked about the policy and about specifics about chauffer's license.

Since there was no further business to come before the Board. At 7:15pm Mr. Thomas moved, seconded by Rev. Collins to adjourn the meeting. The motion was approved unanimously.